

THE IDEA OF TIMBRE IN THE AGE OF HAYDN

A Dissertation

Presented to the Faculty of the Graduate School
of Cornell University

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

by

Emily I. Dolan

August 2006

© 2006 Emily I. Dolan

THE IDEA OF TIMBRE IN THE AGE OF HAYDN

Emily I. Dolan, Ph. D.

Cornell University 2006

At the end of the 18th century, instrumental music, formerly subordinate to vocal music and shackled to the doctrine of imitation, dramatically emerged as a new and powerful form or art, capable of expression. Many scholars today turn to developments in aesthetic philosophy—the birth of German Idealism, “absolute music,” or Kantian formalism—to explain the changing perception of instrumental music. Such explanations, though they illuminate important aspects of contemporary philosophy, ultimately blind us to fascinating developments in musical practice. This dissertation locates the heart of this transformation not in philosophical aesthetics, but in the musical medium itself, specifically focusing on the birth of the concept of *timbre* and the ensuing transformations to musical discourse.

Tracing the concept of timbre from its birth in the writings of Rousseau through its crystallization in the early 19th century with the emergence of “orchestra machines” and a widespread obsession with *effect*, the dissertation explores the impact of the new focus on the musical medium in different registers of musical culture. The project examines the use of the metaphor of color borrowed from painting and Newtonian science, the philosophical attitudes towards transience and

sensation in the writings of Kant and Herder, ideas of composition and orchestration in music treatises, and composers' new uses for the orchestra through close analysis of Haydn's style of orchestration in the 1790s. In addition, the dissertation draws upon as resources many now-forgotten instruments that were invented in this period. Celebrated in their day, these instruments serve as invaluable repositories of the sonorities that captured the 18th- and early 19th-century ear.

These changes in musical practice were fueled by the solidification of the orchestra as a concept, musical body, and institution. Whereas earlier critics likened instrumental sonorities to random paint splatters, later thinkers emphasized the individual character and inherent expressive capacity of each instrument. Only after this radical reevaluation of its foundations could music begin to be recognized as a means to connect with the human heart and mind.

BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH

Born in 1977 in Minneapolis, Minnesota, Emily Dolan attended the University of Minnesota between 1993 and 1999. She studied classics, music, and philosophy, graduating with B.A. *summa cum laude* in Latin. In 2000, Dolan began her studies at Cornell University, where she worked with Neal Zaslaw, Richard Leppert, Annette Richards, and James Webster. She has presented papers at conferences including the national and chapter meetings of the American Musicological Society, the British and American Societies for Eighteenth Century Music, the International Association for Popular Music Studies, and at the Research Center for Social Common Capital at Doshisha University in Kyoto, Japan. Her article, "The Origins of the Orchestra Machine" appeared in *Current Musicology* in the fall of 2003. In 2005, Dolan received an Alvin H. Johnson AMS-50 dissertation fellowship. Dolan will begin a position as assistant professor at the University of Pennsylvania in the fall of 2006

To my mother and the memory of my father,
for everything.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This project is the result of the efforts of many people. I was fortunate to have a wonderful committee, who supported a topic that at first appeared more bizarre than viable. I want to express my profound gratitude to my chair, Neal Zaslaw for the time, patience, and support he gave me throughout my time at Cornell. Many thanks also to James Webster for the time he spent with my written work, and for our many stimulating conversations about Haydn and the 18th century, to Annette Richards, in whose exciting aesthetics seminar my dissertation topic began to take shape, and to Richard Leppert, whose enthusiasm and support have been invaluable.

Many other people have also helped me immensely along the way. I would like to thank the faculty in music at Cornell, especially Becky Harris-Warrick, Judith Peraino, Steve Pond, David Rosen, and Roberto Sierra. My colleagues Nicholas Mathew and Gary Mouldsdale have helped me prepare grant applications and conference papers on countless occasions. Thanks also to Tom Schneller for his help navigating German sources. It is with sadness that I convey my great debt to Lenore Coral, who did not get to see the end of this project. She helped me at many stages of my research, and was also a great friend.

This dissertation would not exist were not for my family. My parents' enthusiasm for my scholarly pursuits gave me the energy to keep working on this project even in the most difficult times. My mother, Rosemarie Dolan, gave me endless support, which ranged from long telephone conversations to fabulous recipes. My father, John

Dolan, gave me unconditional love, help and encouragement, both as a parent and as a professor. He passed away in September of 2005, and remained my teacher until the very end. Many thanks also to my sister, Elizabeth Dolan, and brother-in-law, Charles Geach, and to my brother, Sean Dolan, all of whom helped me during my graduate work. I completed my dissertation on the now war-torn laptop Sean generously gave me three years ago.

I am grateful to the American Musicological Society for awarding me an Alvin H. Johnson AMS 50 Dissertation Fellowship (2005-2006), which allowed me to devote the time to this project that it deserved. The Institute for European Studies at Cornell awarded me a FLAS fellowship (2003-2004) for Italian language study, and two grants to spend time in England and Germany, where I carried out some of my primary source research. I also received two Grout Memorial Scholarships from the Music Department, which enabled me to carry out research in the Netherlands and Russia. Without this support, my project would have been far less interesting. Thanks to Jan Jaap Haspels, curator of the Nationaal Museum van Speelklok tot Pierement in Utrecht, and to Mikhail Gouriev, curator at the State Hermitage Museum in St. Petersburg, for the time and generous help they gave me with their collections.

One of the most wonderful aspects of being at Cornell has been the amazing group of friends I have been fortunate to know. This dissertation owes much to brunches, leisurely tea breaks, and dinners over which we debated the finer points of musicology and life. Many thanks to Augustus Arnone, Fran Brittan, Emily Green, Yotam Haber,

Karen Hiles, Tom Irvine, Nick Mathew, Gary Mouldsdale, Tom Schneller, Dorian Stuber, Marianne Tettlebaum, Wiebke Thormählen, Heidi Voskul, and Nick Wille. Thanks also to Gillian Haro, my oldest friend in the world, who on numerous occasions provided a place to escape to in New York City.

Finally, a very special thanks to Mark Masry; without his love and support, humor and kindness, I could have never made it through this project.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Biographical Sketch	iii
Acknowledgements	v
List of Figures	x
List of Musical Examples	xi
Preface	xii
Introduction	1
Chapter 1: Paint Splatters and Ocular Harpsichords: the Metaphor of Color in Musical Discourse	10
Musical aesthetics in the 18 th century: music’s flexible identity	
Criticisms against instrumental music	
Musical Science and the ocular harpsichord	
Design, color, melody, & harmony	
Random splatters and obscuring shadows	
The metaphor settles in	
Chapter 2: The Birth of “Timbre”	60
18 th -century notions of beautiful sonority	
The glass harmonica as mediator	
Instruments and beauty	
Mozart’s Beautiful Orchestration	
A new conception of orchestral sonority emerges	
Variety, nuance, and the symphony	
Timbre and <u>Klangfarbe</u>	
Case studies: Mozart and Haydn	
Mozart K. 617	
Haydn, Symphony 100 “Military” & Symphony 94 “Surprise”	

Chapter 3: Towards a Musical Monadology: Embracing the Sensation of Sound	134
Kant's difficulty with musical sensation	
Rameau's <i>corps sonore</i> and Herder's monads	
Herder and the fourth <i>Kritische Wäldchen</i>	
Herder's later thought & <i>Kalligone</i>	
The little clavichords in our souls	
Other "early romantics" who embraced tone	
Mere romantic rapture?	
Tones redeemed	
Chapter 4: "Effect! Effect!": Immediacy and Early 19 th -Century Musical Practice	178
Clamoring for (and against) orchestral effect	
The Invention of the Orchestra Machine	
The Problem with Orchestral Sonorities	
The Wind Instruments	
The Idea of Form	
Bibliography	239

LIST OF FIGURES

1.1: Newton’s color wheel with musical pitches	20
1.2: Newton’s color-tone scale	21
1.3: Newton’s color “tonic triad”	21
1.4: Castel’s color-scale	22
1.5 Voltaire, <i>Table des couleurs & des tons de la Musique</i>	27
4.1 Thomas Anton Kunz’s Orchestrion	208
4.2 Franz Leppich’s Panmelodion	209
4.3: Johann Strasser’s Mechanical Orchestra	212
4.4: Gurk’s Panharmonicon	214
4.5: London Advertisement for Gurk’s Panharmonicon	215

LIST OF MUSICAL EXAMPLES

2.1: Mozart, Adagio and Rondo, K. 617, mm. 53-56	114
2.2: Mozart, Adagio and Rondo, K. 617, mm. 196-205	115
2.3: Mozart Adagio and Rondo, K. 617, mm. 1-3	116
2.4: Mozart, Adagio and Rondo, K. 617, mm. 17-20	117
2.5: Mozart, Adagio and Rondo, K. 617, mm. 76-90	119
2.6: Mozart, Adagio and Rondo, K. 617, mm. 91-93 & 178-180	120
2.7: Haydn, Symphony 100 in G major, “Military,” i, mm. 24-31	123
2.8: Haydn, Symphony 100, i, mm. 32-38	124
2.9: Haydn, Symphony 100, i, mm. 39-48	125
2.10: Haydn, Symphony 94 in G major. “Surprise”, ii, mm. 1-16	128
2.11: Haydn, Symphony n. 94, II, mm. 75-81	130
2.12: Haydn, Symphony n. 94, II, mm. 107-115	131

PREFACE

The title of this dissertation reflects the initial plan for the project, which included a chapter devoted to Haydn's "London" Symphonies. This chapter was cut, but Haydn's role in the formation of a new orchestral aesthetic remained central to this project. Because Haydn's presence permeates the remaining chapters, I kept the original title.

I have been asked on several occasions how I originally thought of this topic. In January 2000, shortly after I had mailed in my applications to graduate school, I was driving with a friend when our conversation was brought to halt by curious tones on the radio. We listened with rapt attention to a piece of music that was certainly classical, but performed on an unusual-sounding instrument. I later learned that it was a glass harmonica, an instrument invented by Benjamin Franklin in 1761; the piece of music was Mozart's Adagio and Rondo K617. I was intrigued by the instrument itself (which later became the subject of my research); even more so, I was struck by my reaction to the music. What did it mean to be that captivated by the immediate sound of an instrument? Was that simply because I had never heard it before? How did people listen to the instrument in Mozart's time? What about other instruments? Did inventors produce other instruments with such striking timbres? These queries led to the question that became the frame for this dissertation: when did people start to talk about timbre apart from performance? Exploring this question has been enormously enjoyable, and I often think back to that fortuitous car ride six years ago.